RETURNING TO "THE WAY": REFRAMING AUTHENTICITY TO EMBRACE THE PARADOXES OF THE CAMINO DE SANTIAGO

Ralston Hartness, '18
Washington & Lee University

Religion Department Capstone
December 10, 2017

Abstract: Countless scholars have contributed to our contemporary understanding of pilgrimage and the question of authenticity which it raises. This paper begins with a review of prominent secondary literature on pilgrimage, tourism, and modernity before exploring the concern for authenticity as it is articulated on the Camino de Santiago. According to Charles Taylor, however, this concern for authenticity has been worn out by our prevailing modern discourse. Much of modern ethnography and study of the Camino prioritizes individual, diverse, and self-fulfilling authenticities, which may be just as one-sided as another familiar critique, namely that authenticity resides in a "lost" past. It is the aim of this analysis to examine the theoretical lenses which inform the debates we have about authenticity on the Camino, as well as to reach past the dichotomy between "lost" authenticity and modern, "personally-negotiated" authenticity in order to retrieve a wholeness that is intrinsic to "The Way" itself. In its attempt to retrieve a fuller legacy of the Camino and to embrace the paradoxes present in it, this paper argues for an approach to pilgrimage which acknowledges its historical legacy and does not shy from its inexplicability.

We walked into Bodenaya hopeful, with very wet feet. Our guidebook instructed us that there would be an albergue in this tiny Asturian village, so our spirits soared as each new house came into sight. By only the second day of our journey on the Camino de Santiago Primitivo,[1] we were eager recipients of any hospitality that was offered to us. Finally, we saw small metal signs on the side of a humble stone building which indicated that it was the hoped-for albergue, and we entered to find what looked more like someone's home. David, a compassionate hospitalero who has a lively reputation along the Primitivo, came to greet us and offer us the last two beds available that night. We were instructed to rest, gather our dirty laundry for him to wash, and plan on taking meals with the group of pilgrims like a family. All of this would cost nothing. David pointed to a small wooden box marked "donativo" and told us that we ought to give only however much we were able, if we wanted to give at all.

Later that evening, David gathered all of the pilgrims staying at Albergue Bodenaya to tell us all about the Camino philosophy and why he runs his albergue. Through another pilgrim turned translator, we listened as David told us the tale of what the Camino used to be, and that he continues to provide this hospitality because it was the way hospitaleros served pilgrims on the Camino for centuries.

David, and many other pilgrims and locals, seem to live in constant conversation with themselves and others about preserving the traditions of and participating genuinely in the pilgrimage, especially in the face of expanding tourism and commodification along the Way. As the Camino de Santiago continues to evolve into a pilgrimage more diverse and distinct from the traditional era which David held so dear, questions about what the pilgrimage means and what it means to participate in it resound deeply in the pilgrim's, as well as the scholar's, experience of the Way.

The Camino de Santiago is a historically and culturally situated arena that hosts a complicated network of modern pilgrimages grounded in what I will argue is the intrinsic "authenticity" of the Way itself. While "authenticity" is a contested term in religious studies, and one that is both ubiquitous and vexing in decades of secondary literature on pilgrimage, this paper seeks to show that a revised articulation of "authenticity," or a "work of retrieval of… an ideal that has degraded but that is very worthwhile in itself," to quote Charles Taylor,[2] allows for a more comprehensive, flexible, and dynamic understanding of the modern phenomena of pilgrimage. This paper will focus on the modern life and interpretation of the Camino de Santiago, perhaps the most popular pilgrimage route in the world today, and how contemporary scholars of religion, pilgrimage, tourism, and modernity contribute to our understanding of the complex motives and activities of Camino pilgrims and the effects of modernity on this activity. I will offer a fresh reading of the modern Camino that engages the scholarly literature but goes beyond the available analyses and critiques of the pilgrimage.

Several major scholarly theories characterize the contemporary understanding of pilgrimage and raise the question of "authenticity" I wish to explore. While many scholars have carefully noted powerful and intricate dynamics at play in pilgrimage and on the Camino de Santiago, more specifically, in modernity, some have emphasized the modern to the detriment of the rich historical legacy of the pilgrimage which has drawn countless pilgrims to Santiago for centuries. On the Camino, as in much of Christian practice, however, the modern is not solely modern but also ancient, created before and apart from resources unique to modernity. Returning to this ancient legacy and illustrating the diverse

yet collective origins of what we now think of as the Camino de Santiago stands in contrast to the intensely individualistic picture of modern pilgrimage as "contested," which is embraced in much contemporary scholarship on the Camino. In order to acknowledge the integrity and continuity of the pilgrimage to Santiago, elements of what I will call the "intrinsic authenticity" of the Way, I will argue that pilgrimage is not adequately defined by the intense individuality fostered by modernity nor the nostalgia for what has been "lost," but rather that it reaches beyond this dichotomy to draw upon a rich, corporate and communal identity, intrinsic to the Way itself.

Pilgrimage Theory and the Question of Authenticity

In the 1970's, there was a resurgence of interest in pilgrimage which propelled a rich scholarly discussion about the significance of pilgrimage in the modern world. Since this time, countless scholars have posited their theories about the meaning of pilgrimage and its role in the religious, cultural, and political life. Victor and Edith Turner stood at the forefront of this movement towards pilgrimage as they wrote in the late 1970's about pilgrimage as being a liminoid, anti-structural experience characterized by a social relatedness which they called *communitas*.[3] Since this seminal contribution to the field, scholars such as Simon Coleman and John Eade, as well as Michael Di Giovine, have revised, refuted, and expanded the Turners' thesis to address more dynamic cultural and contested aspects of pilgrimages around the world. Simultaneously, tourism scholars have been interested in exploring the meaning of travel in our increasingly globalized world. Around the time that the Turners were studying social relatedness in the pilgrim setting, Dean MacCannell was beginning to examine social space in tourist settings, arguing that tourism

absorbs some of the functions of religion in modernity.[4] MacCannell played a leading role in the revival of the term "authenticity," a word which stands at the core of the tourist search as he understands it and at the core of pilgrim theorists' concern for understanding the significance of the phenomena of pilgrimage. These arguments have been affecting and responding to the field of pilgrimage and tourism studies for decades, yet it is instructive for us to note that they have all been embraced and applied through the lens and resources of the modern world, which, Charles Taylor argues, is one of individualism and a preoccupation with original identity, or "authenticity."[5] The term "authenticity" will certainly be a contested and polysemic word in this exploration, yet I preserve the term which, I believe, speaks to the core of our theoretical approach to pilgrimage. An elaboration of these pilgrimage and tourism theories will be useful for fully exploring what Taylor suggests are the challenges of authenticity in the modern world, which will lead us to a deeper exploration into the way these theories are articulated on the Camino de Santiago.

Victor Turner and Edith Turner have been the starting point for countless scholarly works on pilgrimage since the 1970's. Simon Coleman and John Eade even begin their own critique and revision of the Turners' thesis by "invoking possibly the most influential text in the anthropology of pilgrimage… *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*."[6] Chronicling diverse Christian pilgrimages from Guadalupe to Walsingham, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* and the Turners' anthropological work, more broadly, sought out to ask "institutional questions about the pilgrimage data."[7] These institutional questions, for the Turners, focused on the structure of values, norms, symbols, and customs which give meaning to the pilgrimage experience. This experience is characterized by an anti-

structural journey away from a mundane center to a "sacred periphery which suddenly, transiently, becomes central for the individual… a symbol of *communitas*."[8] Steeped in anthropology, the Turners took great inspiration from Arnold van Gennep's work on *rites de passage* to argue that pilgrimage was a sort of voluntary liminoid phenomenon in which pilgrims experience symbolic oneness.[9] In pilgrimage as the Turners understood it, the self is found only in the "throng of similars" rather than a throng of "structurally interdependent persons"—[10] the pilgrim enters into a collective periphery which results in a melding of individuality and community such that "solitude and society cease to be antithetical."[11] The Turners' theory of *communitas* is one in which each pilgrim is wrapped up in the aliveness of history,[12] and for whom their own selfhood and meaning is found in the phenomenon of the collective.

Even though the Turners were keenly aware of the questions they left unanswered, and extended a call for other scholars to ask the individual questions they omitted,[13] it would not have required an invitation for a number of scholars to revisit, critique, and revise the *communitas* thesis. At a time when the role of culture was growing in emphasis in anthropology and religious studies, John Coleman and Simon Eade were two of many scholars whose work sought to point out the theoretical *cul de sac* that was the Turners' divorcing pilgrimage from social, political, and cultural processes.[14] Although the Turners interrogated pilgrimages both in plural societies and in societies on which the church laid universal claim,[15] and although they believed pilgrims were wrapped up in the aliveness of history, Coleman and Eade argued that Turnerian anti-structure and separation from society was a model divorced from the complicated and fluid processes which invite "rhetorical, ideologically charged assertions of apparent continuity… in religious and wider

social identities."[16] Instead of being a fully communal and collective endeavor, Coleman and Eade understand pilgrimage to be an inherently contested and embodied act which fills the "empty vessels" of pilgrimages, to use Eade and Sallnow's language from *Contesting the Sacred*, with meaning.[17]

The brevity of this theoretical introduction may cast these scholarly perspectives as dichotomous and polarizing, yet some scholars have worked to bridge the gap between the Turners and their critics. One of these scholars is Michael Di Giovine. Di Giovine's work is much more recent than the Turners or Coleman and Eade, yet he tactfully inserts himself in their discussion about pilgrimage, arguing that there is a need to reconcile their theses.[18] It is the social drama of touristic production, for Di Giovine, which creates the communal significance pilgrims experience on their "hyper-meaningful voyage… which is often steeped in symbols and symbolic action and 'accrete[s] rich superstructures' of mythological representatives."[19] This field of touristic production, which was originally the theoretical language Pierre Bourdieu took in his approach to studying contemporary art, invites multiple epistemic groups to "struggle and compete amongst themselves to best define and utilize the destination."[20] With this understanding of social drama, which itself is an enduring element of cultural anthropology found even in Victor Turner's earlier work on pilgrimage,[21] all contesting stakeholders contribute to the creation of a final product that facilitates an opportunity for shared appreciation and *communitas* to emerge.[22]

The aforementioned pilgrimage theorists have not been the only ones exploring the meanings of travel. Also experiencing a revival in the 1970's was the field of tourism studies, which was occupied by scholars asking questions similar to those asked of pilgrimage. Foremost among these tourism scholars was Dean MacCannell, whose work

probed the social-spatial arrangements of tourism settings and their impacts on the tourist endeavor. MacCannell was not as concerned about groups or cultures as pilgrimage theorists at the time were. Instead, he rooted the tourist endeavor in the *individual's* concern for the shallowness of their lives and their subsequent search for *authenticity.* According to MacCannell, these concerns parallel the ancient concern for experiencing the sacred in "primitive society."[23] Longing for authentic experience, tourists look past the "front" regions, replete with performance, to find the "back" regions, where they can get "in with the natives."[24] It is in these back regions that the tourist thinks real truth is revealed and authentic experience is achieved, yet the modern tour has blurred the lines between front and back such that tourists end up finding only a "staged back region, a kind of living museum for which we have no analytical terms."[25] The authenticity that the modern tourist finds upon setting out from home, and for which she was intensely concerned, according to MacCannell, falls short of being the *real* thing.

Since the term was introduced by MacCannell in 1973,[26] authenticity "continues to hover as a benchmark against which the quality of culture, experience, and life itself are measured."[27] Not all who have employed the concept have done so just as MacCannell did. Indeed, it is important to distinguish between the pilgrim the Turners examined and the tourist MacCannell is treating even though many scholars argue a convergence of these two characters in the modern world.[28] Tourism scholar Erik Cohen makes a distinction between the pilgrim orientation, which seeks the sacred center of the pilgrim's world, and the tourist approach, which strives for something outside the tourist's world.[29] This typology is dangerously simplistic, and it becomes even more so when read in a world in which "a tourist is half a pilgrim, if a pilgrim is half a tourist," to quote the Turners.[30] If what the

Turners say is indeed the case, the question of authenticity becomes highly significant in order to understand how pilgrimage theorists, who, in this exploration, have not emphasized "authenticity" as a characteristic of pilgrimage, and tourism scholars, who employ the term frequently and resolutely, approach the phenomena of pilgrimage in its plural, diverse, and blurry modern forms.

Before engaging in a full analysis of the articulations and critiques of authenticity on the Camino, it is imperative to understand the societal context and resources which have given rise to this modern concern. Charles Taylor speaks to the conditions which underlie the ideal of authenticity in his book, *The Ethics of Authenticity*. Here, Taylor praises authenticity as a valuable ideal, yet he diagnoses our intense concern for authenticity as being deceptively self-defeating because of the individualism of modernity.[31] In Taylor's view, individualism is the force which has discredited the communal orders characteristic of medieval societies and has placed the self, which is bounded and turned inwards, at the center of our own existence.[32] Although it is discussed and sought as freedom, Taylor argues that this individualism flattens and narrows our human lives because individuals no longer construct meaning through dialogue as they did in collective societies. [33] Instead, abandoning the past "horizons of significance" which used to be the individual's source of identity and meaning,[34] moderns restrict the self to being *within* and praise the ideal of living life as a monologue.[35] After adopting this monologic life, the goal then becomes living a fully original identity which is characteristic of our modern and, in Taylor's view, impoverished espousal of authenticity.

Taylor emphasizes two symptoms which lead him to this diagnosis of individualism and its significance for the modern culture of authenticity: self-fulfillment and recognition.

Both of these elements of the modern, individual life are especially salient to this analysis of the question of authenticity as articulated on the contemporary Camino de Santiago. Taylor identifies the quest for self-fulfillment as a problem insofar as it is a symptom of one of his broader critiques, namely that the culture of authenticity has created a sort of soft relativism that leads to what he calls a "liberalism of neutrality."[36] In this morally neutral state, individuals are prevented from any vigorous defense of a moral ideal and, instead, are encouraged to be "true to themselves and to seek their own self-fulfillment."[37] Thus, self-fulfillment becomes an intense personal focus which causes moderns to "lose sight of concerns that transcend them," posing a fundamental threat to meaning that the Turners and their critics, alike, believe exists in pilgrimage. [38] Secondly, this intensely individual world in which we experience the morally neutral state that Taylor criticizes also heightens the importance, and challenge, of recognition. When "horizons of significance" are collapsed and ignored, one is set on a search to find her or his "own original way of being," which must be inwardly generated.[39] Because this original identity is created within, it does not experience the implicit social recognition that existed *a priori* in collective societies. Instead of being able to take for granted the categories from which individuals communally derive their identities, moderns are consumed by the need for recognition.[40] The ways in which individuals are or are not recognized greatly impact their identities and their lives in search of the ideal of authenticity. Whether Taylor's sweeping diagnostic is fully justified is beyond the scope of this analysis. Instead, his questions regarding our concern for authenticity sound as another voice in our rich theoretical landscape and exploration of pilgrimage.

The Shortcomings of the Critique of Authenticity on the Contemporary Camino

In 2016, over 277,000 pilgrims completed the Camino de Santiago and registered with the Pilgrim's Office in Santiago de Compostela.[41] This popularity and participation has not always been characteristic of the Camino, as only 2,500 pilgrims arrived in 1985,[42] and some years saw even fewer pilgrims to Santiago in the centuries between the "golden age of Galician pilgrimage" in the twelfth century and its modern revival.[43] As noteworthy as its numerical growth in recent decades is the Camino's growth in diversity of pilgrims' motivations, means of transport, and appearances. These elements of change on the Camino give rise to contemporary scholarly questions of Camino "authenticity," questions which ask where authenticity resides and who bears it. Ethnographers and others offer insightful readings of how modern pilgrimage diverges from what are presumed to be its authentic foundations. We first turn to these articulations of "lost" authenticity and then to another way of reading the ethnographic and historical record that emphasizes the modern authenticities which pilgrims experience on the Way, holding the term "authenticity" in a certain tension as we explore these dichotomous analytical categories.

It is widely agreed that the Camino, or any pilgrimage, for that matter, was born out of a particular societal model. [44] In the early European middle ages, it has been generalized, people "lived in the presence of the supernatural, which impressed itself on every aspect of human life." [45] The Camino provided medieval pilgrims with an opportunity to be active participants in this presence through their Catholic faith.[46] In medieval Europe, the Catholic Church provided a "shared frame of theological reference" that made the Camino de Santiago a profoundly collective experience.[47] Although it is dangerous to paint a "conventional but perhaps all-too-rosy picture of medieval pilgrimage,"[48] it is important to

note the religiously collective world in which the Camino originated despite there being great diversity, even then, among those on their way to Santiago.[49] It is in this medieval world of Turnerian *communitas* that many modern pilgrims and scholars alike place the authenticity which they consider to be "lost."[50]

Nancy Louise Frey, one of the foremost ethnographers of the Camino de Santiago, reports a conversation with a pilgrim in which he lamented, "I have been a bad pilgrim."[51] This individual illustrates his understanding of what it means to be a good pilgrim by confronting his fear that he has somehow gone astray. Frey discovered that this pilgrim was disappointed by his lack of seriousness on the road and that he held an iconographic image of the original medieval pilgrim which he believed to be better than he was.[52] This medieval pilgrim is pictured as one with a staff, leather pouch, scallop shells, and felt hat, all of which would mark him as a pilgrim and were emblematic of Saint James.[53] These symbols continue to live on in novelties and souvenirs that can be purchased at markets along the Way.[54] Those marketplaces often increase in size and intensity as one nears the end of the pilgrimage.[55] Modern pilgrims are also seen hanging scallop shells from their rucksacks or pinning the cross of Saint James on their ball cap. Both symbols point backwards to the iconography associated with the *original* pilgrim. Beyond the iconography of their physical appearance, many look back to medieval pilgrims as those of devout faith, penitential motives, and stark simplicity.[56] Leaving everything except the bare necessities at home, the medieval pilgrim set out with an authenticity which was demonstrated, according to Frey, by the pilgrim's "sacrifice, endurance, and austerity."[57]

Another element in the iconographic image of authenticity is how medieval pilgrims were seen as "true" pilgrims by church authorities, fellow pilgrims, and locals. One way that

pilgrims were validated was by carrying a credential, which was a document from a religious authority accrediting the pilgrim's mission.[58] This practice persists even among modern pilgrims on the Way, and it perhaps reveals a more contested narrative about what could be called "lost" authenticity. Today, pilgrims must acquire a credential from the Church, its institutions such as a parish or confraternity, or a Church-authorized organizations for two reasons. The first is that the credential gives pilgrims access to the infrastructure of the Camino.[59] Credentials were popularized in the twelfth century in order to prevent "false" pilgrims from abusing the infrastructure and hospitality intended for genuine pilgrims.[60] Even in the heyday of medieval pilgrimage, there existed thugs who charged pilgrims tolls to cross their property and committed violent acts against pilgrims.[61] The protection, however, that the credential afforded pilgrims was primarily against those who were *pretending* to be pilgrims. Often, merchants would adopt the guise of pilgrims in order to accrue benefits afforded to true pilgrims while selling their own merchandise.[62] The credential then, just as it does now, gave the church and other local authorities the ability to act as "gatekeepers," controlling those who set out on the Way.[63] Requiring pilgrims to show their credential at every *albergue,* and instructing them to stamp it between once and twice daily, the Church used and continues to use this ancient method to ensure that benefits are provided only to authentic pilgrims. [64]

In addition to protecting true pilgrims from pretending ones, the second purpose for the credential was to provide pilgrims access to the *Compostela,*[65] which, according to a "pilgrims' passport" issued by the Xunta de Galicia, is "a document granted by the Cathedral chapter which certifies that the pilgrimage has been undertaken for religious or spiritual reasons."[66] The *Compostela* constitutes the papal pardon of sin which is offered to pilgrims

as it has been since Pope Calixto II granted Santiago Holy Year status in 1122 C.E.[67] It is no surprise that this document has been one of the ways in which the church has intervened to attempt to preserve what it believes is "the traditional pilgrimage to Santiago," which was, according to the Spanish Diocesan Commission in 1993, "made on foot... However, the essential part of the pilgrimage is to make it with a spirit of faith and this is not linked to any mode of transport."[68] Even in its emphasis on the faith, belief, and devotion which merit the *Compostela* today, the church still contends that authenticity is best defined by a traditional and historic mode of pilgrimage to Santiago.

The pilgrim's appearance, credential, and *Compostela* are all iconographic elements of the Camino which live on in the modern life of the pilgrimage. These elements help us to examine what is meant by historic, or "lost," Camino authenticity. However, depending on their motives, some pilgrims today opt for a cultural document or certificate of distance instead of the *Compostela* upon arrival in Santiago.[69] Thus, there exists a different reading of the ethnographic and historic record that aligns with more recent scholarship on the Camino and, ultimately, speaks more to the individual and plural authenticities present on the contemporary Camino.

The Camino experienced an abrupt decline in pilgrims as it came face to face with the potent critiques of Protestant reformers in the sixteenth century.[70] As Europe entered an era of religious change and intellectual exploration, pilgrimage evolved to emphasize a culture of journeying which prioritized "the fulfillment of the person 'down here,' and… the expression of personal freedom."[71] The "journey" adopted a knowledge-oriented approach which conflated pilgrimage—[72] the medieval journey *par excellence*—and the Grand Tour, which evolved into what is considered to be modern tourism.[73] Although pilgrims never

stopped venturing to Santiago, the sixteenth through early twentieth centuries were eras of decline and stagnation in the number of pilgrims on the Way.[74]

Even though the Camino experienced what could be called its "dark ages" in early modern Europe, the Camino experienced a reanimation in the late-twentieth century bringing along a discussion of spirituality, cultural heritage, and individual authenticity. [75] In 1982, the first modern guidebook for the Camino de Santiago was written and, a few years later, a modern system of *albergues* was established.[76] Along with modern mass transportation, these developments promised an increase in the pilgrim traffic on the Way.[77] Infrastructure was not the only modern development that sparked a renewed interest in the pilgrimage, as individual actors such as Pope John Paul II took great interest in promoting the Camino de Santiago.[78] With his visits in 1982 and 1989, Pope John Paul II encouraged Europeans to participate in the pilgrimage as an expression of their cultural identity, stating, "Pilgrimage to Santiago was one of the strong elements that favored the mutual understanding of different European peoples."[79] This cultural rhetoric advanced by the Pope elevated the Camino to the status of UNESCO World Heritage site in 1993, which not surprisingly overlapped one of the most trafficked Holy Years to date.[80]

The recent fame of the Camino has undoubtedly helped to establish the religious and adventure tourism agencies which attract to the Way a much broader audience than the church, and against whom many modern defenses of "lost" authenticity have been targeted. Riding on the heels of cultural rhetoric, many tourist agencies emphasize a more leisurely and pleasurable trip to Santiago than that associated with the image of the penitential, traditional pilgrim.[81] Additionally, tourist agencies market a Camino experience

that fulfills the desires and needs of travelers, who select their trips from various pre-packaged itineraries.[82]

While triggering defenses of "lost" authenticity claims by some pilgrims and authorities, these cultural and tourist developments have prompted an argument that authenticity on the contemporary Camino is an inherently individual, or "personally-negotiated" concern.[83] Nancy Louise Frey writes of the Camino, "Each person creates his or her personally meaningful experience… With almost complete certainty, one can say that there is no 'best' or 'most authentic' way."[84] Frey believes that, even though pilgrims feel like they are participating in a collective, shared journey, individuals are the wielders of the authenticities which they set out on their "quest," to use MacCannell's language, to find.[85] This aligns with a similar interrogation of modern authenticity which claims that, because the Camino has become less ascetic and more "mystical" in nature,[86] it is no longer the experience of collective homogenization but what the pilgrim gets out of her unique, original experience that constitutes her authenticity. [87] Another scholar observes, "The authenticity of the personal spiritual process transcends the conformity required by the institution."[88] The question of authenticity is read, here, in a fundamentally modern way that contrasts the "lost" authenticity reading that valued a collective and iconographic past. This leaves our question of authenticity in a dichotomous position, as it is pulled apart by those who lament its loss and pieced together by others who praise its modern vitality. It is in this predicament that Charles Taylor believes the authenticity becomes fundamentally indefensible and insignificant, and in need of restoration. [89]

The Intrinsic Authenticity of the Way

These two prominent articulations of authenticity leave us as scholars and pilgrims in a difficult analytical position. We should not simply abandon our concern for authenticity though, as both MacCannell and Taylor place it as a central and worthwhile question in our modern lives.[90] However, the way forward in this dichotomous landscape remains uncertain. On one hand, stakeholders on the Camino can point to its medieval and collective heyday as the truest, but "lost," articulation of authenticity; conversely, many contemporary scholars define authenticity as intensely individual phenomena which exist in many modern, personally-negotiated forms. The contradictory state of these critiques cannot itself serve as a definition for pilgrimage, nor can it respond to our question of authenticity without engaging in the power struggle which pits pilgrim against pilgrim as well as pilgrim against authorities.[91] This would result in a crippled understanding of the meaning of the Camino as a whole, as well as the authenticity sought in it. If we are to approach the phenomena of pilgrimage and the question of authenticity which it raises on the Camino de Santiago, we must reach beyond seemingly contradictory understandings to *embrace* the paradoxes of the pilgrimage— the intrinsic authenticity which has been continuous throughout both the *communitas* in its collective origins and the diversity in its modern form. Doing this brings us into touch with a wholeness that retrieves and restores the Way, as well as our understanding of pilgrimage as a meaningful ritual in the modern world.

Returning to our initial exploration of pilgrimage theory will allow us to look beyond the surface of the apparent rifts in our understanding of Camino phenomena. Numerous pilgrimage and tourism scholars have contributed to our contemporary

discourse by offering approaches to understanding what it is that gives pilgrimage its meaning. Although none of these theorists encouraged the use of fixed analytical categories, many of their approaches have been interpreted as such.[92] The Turners emphasized the communal, homogenizing nature of pilgrimage which was so evident in the medieval life of the Camino. For Coleman and Eade as well as Di Giovine, pilgrimage is made meaningful by contestation and cooperation between various groups of stakeholders. This more recent theoretical perspective appears to be most characteristic of the contemporary Camino. Dean MacCannell, who introduced the term "authenticity" as the goal of both the pilgrim's and tourist's quests, wrote skeptically about the tourist's ability to experience and achieve that end. This skepticism towards authenticity has continued to resound in a modern world in which pilgrims and tourists seem to be conflated characters. These theoretical approaches, although they provide a basis for considering pilgrimage as a meaningful endeavor and exploring the evolution of our understandings of it, narrow the landscape of the modern Camino if they are interpreted only through our prominent modern discourse which, according to Taylor, is restricted by its emphasis on individuality.[93] Reading the Camino data in this way may lead us to a dismissal of the legacy and integrity which are, no doubt, still present on the Way today.

Instead of falling in to the panoptic state that Coleman and Eade spoke against in their analysis of pilgrimage,[94] I propose that the Camino de Santiago invites an embrace of paradoxes and complexities that, ultimately, may perform the work of retrieval that Charles Taylor deems necessary in order to more fully address the question of authenticity.[95] Nancy Louise Frey helps us to see some of these complexities of the Camino through her observation, "The Camino can be (among many other things) a union with nature, a

vacation, an escape from the drudgery of the everyday, a spiritual path to the self and humankind… It is 'done' and 'made' as a pilgrimage, but what does that mean now?"[96] It seems, as Frey suggests, that the presence of intense diversity and individual meaning could turn "pilgrimage" into a catchall, relative distinction appropriate for anyone's journey.[97] Luigi Tomasi observed similar dynamics at the Youth Rally in Rome during the Jubilee year pilgrimage in 2000:

> The spiritual component was flanked by the human one. Were these young people tourists, Catholics, the curious, holiday-makers, or pilgrims? It is difficult to say. Perhaps they were all of these and more, and all at once. Guides to Rome mixed with prayer books, and the merging of devotion and tourism was evident; the mingling of religion and religious tourism was obvious. The stone used as a pillow, typical of the pilgrim of the past and symbolic of penitence, had given way to the cellular phone, the paramount symbol of comfort in the modern age, and of the tourist-pilgrim of Jubilee 2000. But yet they came.[98]

The abundant complexity and diversity in motives, appearance, and approaches to pilgrimage is evident in this narrative of another instance of contemporary Christian pilgrimage. However, Tomasi does not simply note or lament this diversity and contestation. Instead, he shifts the focus away from the panoply of individual elements and dichotomous symbols to the profound reality of the 2.5 million young people who were present in the pilgrimage itself.

Part of this profound reality is the meaning which modern pilgrims continue to derive from a shared or communal journey. As we saw through the Turners' emphasis on a *communitas*-generating social reality present in many pilgrimage, the importance of a shared, collective character is a timeless theme in pilgrimage studies.[99] In this communal perspective, the shared journey gives meaning to nearly every element of pilgrimage, from taking meals together to visiting the

marketplace.[100] In Frey's analysis of what holds the disparate elements of the Camino together, she, too, credits the shared nature of the journey with this cohesive role.[101] Apart from theorists and ethnographers, countless pilgrims, themselves, comment on the profound companionship they enjoyed with others from around the globe during their pilgrimage, especially after they have returned home and no longer experience this level of collective mission or interdependence.[102] This is one of many sources of emotions that can be confusing and unexpected when some pilgrims arrive in Santiago de Compostela, which goes further to suggest that the shared journey, and the companionship that grows through it, is an undeniably significant element of the contemporary Camino and pilgrimage more broadly.[103]

Although the Camino allows pilgrims to develop meaningful relationships as they approach Santiago, this communal experience does not fully address our concern for retrieving an authenticity which looks underneath and through a dichotomous analytical landscape. As long as meaning is founded upon social relationships and *communitas* there will be outliers who complicate this evaluation. There are those on the Camino who walk in solitude, camp in tents, or keep to themselves in *albergues*, yet they still report having impactful and meaningful experiences on the Way. Additionally, outlying pilgrims, especially those who appear to be more like tourists, pose potential threats to those who appear more "traditional,"[104] and that may cause these "traditional" pilgrims to intensify their practices and methods in response.[105] All of these dynamics of solitary or otherwise outlying pilgrims on the Camino are illustrations of Di Giovine's suggestion that meaning is created through social drama in pilgrimage settings.

If we are to find a more adequate articulation of authenticity on the Camino, perhaps there is a fuller way to look through this contested landscape that seeks not to change the condition or diversity of modern pilgrims but, rather, to embrace the paradoxes intrinsic to the Way. In his view of the Jubilee pilgrimage, Tomasi embraced the paradoxes among the young people there by saying, "Perhaps they were all of these and more, and all at once."[106] The same could be said of the Camino itself, a pilgrimage which has lived its own dynamic, privileged, and challenged life since the early middle ages. This analysis has shown that the Camino has been a homogeneous and collective experience, a place of fervent penitence, an abandoned remnant of Catholic supremacy, a cultural gem, and a modern arena for seekers and skeptics. Perhaps today it could be all of these and more, and all at once.

Acknowledging and embracing the power and mystery of these paradoxes that are intrinsic to the Way expands what was previously a dichotomous analytical landscape to one that widens and, ultimately, restores our horizons beyond those preoccupied with self-fulfillment and recognition.[107] The pilgrim is no longer seeking only to regain a "lost" authenticity. Conversely, participants are no longer wholeheartedly committed to accepting the openness of "personally-negotiated" authenticities. Instead, by embracing this paradoxical and intrinsic nature of the Way, the pilgrim achieves an authenticity that is intimately connected to and grounded in the whole.[108] Though this authenticity is fundamentally different from the inward authenticity which is said to concern most modern individuals, it may well be that connection to the intrinsic nature of the Way in fact restores an even truer form of authenticity than the pilgrim has been seeking. This authenticity is not only a recovery of the pilgrim's own self,[109] but it is also a participation

in an ancient truth in the form of the Way itself. It is this paradoxical wholeness that the Welsh poet R.S. Thomas describes so well:

> These people are not
> late or soon; they are just
> here with only the one question
> to ask, which life answers
> by being in them. It is I
> who ask. Was the pilgrimage
> I made to come to my own
> self, to learn that in times
> like these and for one like me
> God will never be plain and
> out there, but dark rather and
> inexplicable, as though he were in here?
> (R.S. Thomas, "Pilgrimages")

Thomas, too, reaches beyond the dichotomy, contradiction, and diversity that have blurred our approach to the question of authenticity. Life answers that question in its simplicity. The Camino is not lost. Neither past nor present have undermined the integrity and continuity of something so much greater than its individual parts.

Conclusions

The question of authenticity is one deeply rooted in pilgrimage. However, the prevailing theoretical approach to this concern has been one of dichotomy and contradiction, rooted in the familiar challenges of a modern, individualistic discourse. Instead of comparing modern participants to medieval pilgrims who appear to be truer or more genuine, or, on the other hand, expecting pilgrims to personally author each of their own authenticities, we should look underneath and through the contestation and tension to retrieve the integrity and continuity of the Way. Embracing this intrinsic authenticity requires confronting the inexplicable significance of pilgrimage which is undoubtedly more

challenging than adopting concrete analytical categories. However, approaching the question of authenticity in this way not only enables a fresher, more comprehensive theoretical perspective, but it also allows for a more flexible and restorative understanding of the role of pilgrimage in what seems to be an increasingly diverse and blurry modern world. Even though this analysis limited its scope to the Camino de Santiago and only a few of the loudest voices in the theoretical discussion, it would be enlightening to attempt to broaden this intrinsic approach to examine other phenomena of pilgrimage. Although David told a tale of "lost" tradition and sincerity, he retrieved and embraced those legacies as he welcomed modern pilgrims in to his *albergue*. Perhaps it is in the simultaneous embrace of legacy and modernity that the wholeness of the Way comes alive in him and makes his *albergue*, and the whole Camino, a place for the spiritual, traditional, skeptical, and solitary, and more, all at once.

Endnotes

[1] The Camino de Santiago Primitivo is one of many approaches to Santiago de Compostela. It is called the Primitivo, or "Primitive Way," because it is considered by many to be the first route to Santiago. The Primitivo begins in Oviedo and winds through the mountains of Asturias before joining the Camino Frances from Melide to Santiago de Compostela. The Primitivo is less trafficked and more remote than the Camino Frances, offering a unique appeal to outdoor enthusiasts and other "non-traditional" pilgrims.
[2] Charles Taylor, *The Ethics of Authenticity* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1991), 23.
[3] Victor Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1974), 201.
[4] Dean MacCannell, "Staged Authenticity: Arrangements of Social Space in Tourism Settings," *The American Journal of Sociology* 79, no. 3 (Nov., 1973): 589.
[5] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 17.
[6] Simon Coleman and John Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," in *Reframing Pilgrimage: Cultures in Motion* eds. Simon Coleman and John Eade (London: Routledge, 2004), 1.
[7] Victor Turner and Edith Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1978), *xiv*.
[8] Ibid., 34.
[9] Ibid., 2.
[10] Ibid., 17.
[11] Victor Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors*, 203.
[12] Ibid., 228.
[13] Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture, xiv*.
[14] Coleman and Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," 3.
[15] Turner and Turner, Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* 6.
[16] Coleman and Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," 15.
[17] Coleman and Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," 4
[18] Michael Di Giovine, "Pilgrimage: Communitas and contestation, unity and difference- An Introduction," Tourism 59, no. 3 (2011): 255.
[19] Ibid., 249. Di Giovine cites the Turners' (Victor and Edith Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* 23) discussion of the growth of pilgrimages and the powerful spontaneous-turned-normative *communitas* they develop.
[20] Ibid., 260.
[21] Victor Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors,* 17.
[22] Di Giovine, "Pilgrimage," 257.
[23] MacCannell, "Staged Authenticity," 590.
[24] Ibid., 594. This language of "front" and "back" regions is one that MacCannell adopts from Erving Goffman. Although the terms are not the core of MacCannell's thesis, and he problematizes them in his claim that these regions have become increasingly blurry, they are especially instructive to note in understanding MacCannell's methodological approach to social spaces and his "way in" to interrogating authenticity.
[25] Ibid., 595-596.
[26] Konstantinos Andriotis, "Genres of Heritage Authenticity: Denotations from a Pilgrimage Landscape," *Annals of Tourism Research* 38, no. 4 (2011): 1613.
[27] Robert J. Shepherd, "Why Heidegger Did Not Travel: existential angst, authenticity, and tourist experiences," *Annals of Tourism Research* 52 (February, 2015): 60.
[28] For a detailed discussion of this convergence, see William Swatos, "Canterbury Trails," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002), 91-114; Victor Turner, "Pilgrimage as Social Processes," in *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1974), 166-230.
[29] Katharina Schramm, "Coming home to the Motherland: Pilgrimage Tourism in Ghana," in *Reframing Pilgrimage: Cultures in Motion* eds. Simon Coleman and John Eade (London: Routledge, 2004), 136-137.

[30] Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*, 20.
[31] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 1. There is much data that suggests there is a human condition closely associated with the priorities and concerns of our modern world. Taylor is one voice among many who believes this to be true. As I proceed in this paper, I hold "modern individual" and similar phrasings in a certain tension that both acknowledges the contemporary mode of being Taylor and others are critical of and hopes for a way of moving forward in which the individual, or pilgrim, is not crippled by "malaise." I cannot deny, and I actually attempt to embrace, the characteristics of modernity which exhibit malaise in the world and in pilgrimage. However I believe that this paradoxical situation enables me to identify an integrity which exists in individuals and pilgrimage underneath and through the malaise, nostalgia, *communitas,* and diversity. Thus, I cannot claim to provide an easy analytical category in which we can place the modern individual or pilgrim, but I proceed in this paradox.
[32] Charles Taylor, "The Bulwarks of Belief," in *A Secular Age* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007), 30. Taylor elaborates on the modern individual thoroughly in *A Secular Age.* I note his claims about individualism and briefly cite his buffered characterization insofar as it plays in to his own interrogation of authenticity.
[33] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 3.
[34] Ibid., 38.
[35] Ibid., 33.
[36] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 17.
[37] Ibid., 14.
[38] Ibid., 15. *Sacred* is as contested a term in religious studies as any, and I do not wish to insert myself into that debate at the present moment. Instead, it is enough to note that the *sacred* transcends the individual, which is the exact end that Taylor sees as a result of modern individualization.
[39] Ibid., 47.
[40] Ibid., 49.
[41] "The Pilgrimage to Santiago in 2016," Oficina de Acogida al Peregrino, Statistics, 2017, https://oficinadelperegrino.com/en/statistics/.
[42] Michael Murray, "The Cultural Heritage of Pilgrimage Itineraries: The Camino de Santiago," *Journeys* 15, no. 2 (2014): 73.
[43] Luigi Tomasi, "Homo Viator: From Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism via the Journey," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002), 5.
[44] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 7.
[45] Otto von Simson, *The Gothic Cathedral: Origins of Gothic Architecture and the Medieval Concept of Order* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1956), 165. Diving in to the complexity of the medieval Camino is beyond the scope of this work. Thankfully, scholars such as Luigi Tomasi, Lutz Kaelber, and Thomas Spaccarelli all contribute rich understandings of the medieval Camino to the fields of pilgrimage studies and medieval history. I use "early European middle ages" here as a generalization for the ninth century when the Camino de Santiago originated and began its growth. Tomasi adds about this time in Europe, "The pilgrim of the Middle Ages had been legitimated by the social context of the time, a society in which the sacred was forcefully present and exerted its own fascination" (p. 7).
[46] Thomas D. Spaccarelli, "Liturgical Reform in Medieval Spain and the Response of the Pilgrim Movement," *Law Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures* 36, no. 2 (Spring, 2008): 260-261.
[47] William H. Swatos, Jr., "New Canterbury Trails: Pilgrimage and Tourism in Anglican London," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2004), 97.
[48] Lutz Kaebler, "The Sociology of Medieval Pilgrimage: Contested Views and Shifting Boundaries," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002), 66.
[49] Ibid., 94.
[50] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 41. Some scholars believe that it is out of their nostalgia for this "lost" authentic past that modern individuals go on pilgrimage. See Konstantinos Andriotis, "Genres of Heritage Authenticity," 1627.
[51] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 125.
[52] I use the word "iconographic" to suggest an interpretation of the Camino which is informed by various symbols and elements, be them historic or contemporary. Many of these symbols are associated with the iconography of Saint James. However, the Camino de Santiago has gained an iconography of its own over the centuries.

[53] Ibid. Each of these symbols are attached to the cult of Saint James based on the legend of his being transported from Jerusalem to Spain and the mysterious discovery of his body in the ninth century by a hermit named Pelayo. Hiking guides such as Landis and Dintamann, *A Village to Village Guide to Hiking the Camino de Santiago* (Harrisonburg: Village to Village Press, 2016), 17 provide great detail on the symbolic items of medieval pilgrims. The staff was carried for practical uses such as hanging drinking gourds or protecting oneself, but it was also symbolic of the cross of Christ and the shepherd image. The leather pouch was less practical but it reminded pilgrims to carry little. Since there was no closure on traditional pouches, it reminded pilgrims to give and receive freely. The scallop shell is described by the *Codex Calixtinus* as resembling an open hand, symbolizing the good deeds expected of pilgrims. Others claim the shell became a symbol of the converging routes upon one destination at Santiago de Compostela. Finally, there is a tale that the body of Saint James startled a horse when it was pulled onshore in Spain, and that the horse and its rider fell into the sea. They were saved, however, and emerged covered in scallop shells. This symbol has countless roots. It could be argued that it has become the brand of the Camino.

[54] Ibid., 166.

[55] Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors,* 183.

[56] Conrad Rudolph, *Pilgrimage to the End of the World: The Road to Santiago de Compostela* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2004), 15; Swatos, "New Canterbury Trails," 98.

[57] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 15.

[58] Ibid., 68.

[59] Ibid., 67.

[60] Ibid., 68.

[61] Rudolph, *Pilgrimage to the End of the World,* 6.

[62] Von Simson, *The Gothic Cathedral,* 165.

[63] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 68.

[64] Anna Dintamann and David Landis, *A Village to Village Guide to Hiking the Camino de Santiago* (Harrisonburg: Village to Village Press, 2016), 21.

[65] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 67.

[66] "The Primitive Way: Pilgrim's Passport," Xunta de Galicia, 2017. "Pilgrim's passport" is modern title that is used interchangeably for credential, or *credencial* in Spanish. This passport that I received upon entering Galicia this summer was issued by the Xunta, or government, of Galicia. Many governments, confraternities, and other civil societies have been allowed by the Church to print and distribute credentials which pilgrims may use on their journey. Credentials of various origins serve the same purpose along the way and upon arrival, but it could be fascinating to explore how well-received credentials are depending on their church, state, or other origin. It is because this is a modern document that it uses the word "spiritual." This would not have been used in any official documents during the Camino's medieval life.

[67] Michael Murray, "The Cultural Heritage of Pilgrim Itineraries," 68.

[68] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 126-127.

[69] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 160.

[70] Lutz Kaelber, "The Sociology of Medieval Pilgrimage," 64. Martin Luther himself proclaimed, "The true Christian pilgrimage is not to Rome, or Compostela, but to the prophets, the Psalms, and the Gospels."

[71] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 13.

[72] Di Giovine, "Pilgrimage," 249.

[73] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 14-15.

[74] The complexity of this historical process is not to be understated. Scholars trace numerous threads across these centuries which highlight the solemnity and iconoclasm of the Protestant faith, the evolution of a separation between "work" and "leisure," and the emergence of the "free time" ideal that came with Industrialization and propelled modern tourism. These developments were not linear but they all, among other factors, were intimately related. See Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* 34-39; Luigi Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 13-17.

[75] "Early modern" here refers to the period of time lasting from the Reformation through the industrial revolutions. Although a small trickle of pilgrims persisted, the Camino was dormant throughout this period and continuing in to the nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. I choose "early modern" as the temporal frame here because of the

impact that the intellectual and industrial developments during this period had on the life of the Camino even beyond it.
[76] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 14-15.
[77] Ian Reader, "Pilgrimage Growth in the Modern World: Meanings and Implications," *Religion* 37, no. 3 (Feb., 2011): 211.
[78] Ibid., 220.
[79] Liliane Voye, "Popular Religion and Pilgrimages in Western Europe," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002), 118; Pope John Paul II, *Atto Europeistico,* Vatican Website, Nov. 9, 1982, Sec. 3, https://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/it/speeches/1982/november/documents/hf_jp-ii_spe_19821109_atto-europeistico.html. Pope John Paul II was a strong advocate for the Camino de Santiago. He made two pilgrimages to Santiago, in 1982 and 1989, and he appealed to Goethe once, who stated, "The conscience of Europe was born out of pilgrimage."
[80] Murray, "The Cultural Heritage of Pilgrimage Itineraries," 73. It is significant to note that it was only the Camino Frances that was afforded this distinction in 1993. Other approaches to Santiago have not received the same international and cultural attention as has the Frances. This is an example of what Eade and Sallnow (1991) meant when they said that meaning is bestowed upon pilgrimage in contested and power-laden ways.
[81] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 16.
[82] Maria I. Macioti, "Pilgrimages of Yesterday, Jubilees of Today," in *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism* eds. William H. Swatos, Jr. and Luigi Tomasi (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002), 84.
[83] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 136.
[84] Ibid.
[85] MacCannell, "Staged Authenticity," 593.
[86] Swatos, "New Canterbury Trails," 98.
[87] Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* 34; Swatos, "New Canterbury Trails," 98.
[88] Voye, "Popular Religion and Pilgrimages in Western Europe," 125.
[89] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 38.
[90] MacCannell, "Staged Authenticity," 293; Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 23.
[91] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 126.
[92] Coleman and Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," 23; Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture, xv.*
[93] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 29.
[94] Coleman and Eade, "Introduction: Reframing Pilgrimage," 23.
[95] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 23.
[96] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 5.
[97] This is an illustration of what Charles Taylor is concerned about in his criticism of "liberalism of neutrality." It is instructive to remember that this state is one in which a vigorous defense of any moral idea is off-limits. I believe Frey's final question, "What does it mean now?" can be read not only as her broad research question throughout the course of her study, but also as the vexing and exasperated iteration of the questioning of truth and meaning with which many of us are familiar. See Charles Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 17.
[98] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 21.
[99] Turner and Turner, *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture,* 31. The Turners believed that pilgrimage, as a liminoid phenomenon, was a voluntary endeavor. Thus, the decision to participate in pilgrimage is an individual. This, however, brings the individual into "fellowship with like-minded souls." It is in this fellowship that *communitas* is generated.
[100] Turner, *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors,* 188
[101] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 5.
[102] Kyung-Mi Im and JuSung Jun, "The Meaning of Learning on the Camino de Santiago Pilgrimage," *Australian Journal of Adult Learning* 55, no. 2 (July 2015): 348.
[103] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,* 177.
[104] Frey, *Pilgrim Stories,*
[105] J.Z. Smith, *To Take Place: Toward Theory in Ritual (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1987),* 109. Smith provides a rich analysis of ritual in his book that I wish could be developed more fully here. Smith argues that rituals are, fundamentally, performances of the way things ought to be which act in tension against the way things

are. In this framework, ritual is not weakened by incongruence or opposition but it actually intensifies and gains force where incongruence is perceived. This is a salient view of ritual for the way contestation and drama may emerge between groups of pilgrims on the Camino, and it is one reason why the shared journey allocates meaning and authenticity inconsistently.

[106] Tomasi, "Homo Viator," 21.

[107] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 38.

[108] Taylor, *Ethics of Authenticity,* 91.

[109] Ibid.

Bibliography of Works Cited

Andriotis, Konstantinos. “Genres of Heritage Authenticity: Denotations from a Pilgrimage Landscape.” *Annals of Tourism Research* 38, no. 4 (2011): 1613-1633.

Coleman, Simon and John Eade, eds. *Reframing Pilgrimage: Cultures in Motion.* London: Routledge, 2004.

Di Giovine, Michael A. “Pilgrimage: Communitas and Contestation, Unity and Difference- An Introduction.” *Tourism* 59, no. 3 (2011): 247-269.

Dintaman, Anna and David Landis. *A Village to Village Guide to Hiking the Camino de Santiago.* Harrisonburg: Village to Village Press, 2016.

Frey, Nancy Louise. *Pilgrim Stories: On and Off the Road to Santiago*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998.

Im, Kyung-Mi and JuSung Jun. “The Meaning of Learning on the Camino de Santiago Pilgrimage.” *Australian Journal of Adult Learning* 55, no. 2 (July, 2015): 331-351.

MacCannell, Dean. “Staged Authenticity: Arrangements of Social Space in Tourist Settings.” *The American Journal of Sociology* 79, no. 3 (Nov., 1973): 589-603.

Murray, Michael. “The Cultural Heritage of Pilgrim Itineraries: The Camino de Santiago.” *Journeys* 15, no. 2 (2014): 65-85.

John Paul II. *Atto Europeistico* [European Act at Santiago de Compostela]. Vatican Website. Nov. 9, 1982. https://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/it/speeches/1982/november/documents/hf_jp-ii_spe_19821109_atto-europeistico.html.

Oficina de Acogida al Peregrino. “*La Pregrinación a Santiago en 2016* [The Pilgrimage to Santiago in 2016].” Statistics. 2017. https://oficinadelperegrino.com/en/statistics/.

Reader, Ian. “Pilgrimage Growth in the Modern World: Meaning and Implications.” *Religion* 37, no. 3 (February, 2011): 210-229.

Rudolph, Conrad. *Pilgrimage to the End of the World: The Road to Santiago de Compostela.* Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2004.

Shepherd, Robert J. “Why Heidegger did not travel: Existential angst, authenticity, and tourist experiences.” *Annals of Tourism Research* 52 (Mar., 2015): 60-71.

Spaccarelli, Thomas D. “Liturgical Reform in Medieval Spain and the Response of the Pilgrim Movement.” *La Corónica: A Journal of Medieval Hispanic Languages, Literatures, and Cultures* 36, no. 2 (Spring, 2008): 257-272.

Smith, Jonathan Z. *To Take Place: Toward Theory in Ritual.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

Swatos, William H., Jr. and Luigi Tomasi, eds. *From Medieval Pilgrimage to Religious Tourism: The Social and Cultural Economics of Piety*. Westport: Praeger Publishers, 2002.

Taylor, Charles, “The Bulwarks of Belief.” In *A Secular Age.* Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2007.

Taylor, Charles. *The Ethics of Authenticity*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1991.

Thomas, Ronald Stuart. “Pilgrimages.” In *Selected Poems.* London: Penguin Books, 2004.

Turner, Victor. *Dramas, Fields, and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1974.

Turner, Victor and Edith Turner. *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1978.

von Simson, Otto. *The Gothic Cathedral: Origins of Architecture and the Medieval Concept of Order*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1956.

Bibliography of Works Consulted

Bregman, Lucy. *The Ecology of Spirituality: Meanings, Virtues, and Practices in a Post-Religious Age.* Waco: Baylor University Press, 2014.

Casey, Edward S. *Getting Back into Place: Toward a Renewed Understanding of the Place-World.* Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009.

Cousineau, Phil. *The Art of Pilgrimage: The Seeker's Guide to Making Travel Sacred.* San Francisco: Conari Press, 1998.

Geertz, Clifford. "Deep Play: Notes on the Balinese Cockfight." *Daedalus* 134, no. 4 (Fall, 2005): 56-86.

Korstanje, Maximiliano E. "The Obsession with Authenticity: Criticism to Dean MacCannell." *Revista Rosa dos Ventos* 5, no. 1 (Mar., 2013): 99-115.

Lucarno, Guido. "The Camino de Santiago de Compostela (Spain) and The Via Francigena (Italy): a comparison between two important historic pilgrimage routes in Europe." *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage* 4, no. 7 (2016): 48-58.

MacCannell, Dean. "Why it Never Really was About Authenticity." *Society* 45 (2008): 334-337.

Milnes, Peter. "The Pilgrim Model: Using Transactional Analysis to Explore the Spiritual Pathway Toward Meaning and Knowing." *Transcational Analysis Journal* 47, no. 3 (2017): 203-217.

Nilsson, Mats and Mekonnen Tesfahuney. "Performing the 'post-secular' in Santiago de Compostela." *Annals of Tourism Research* 57 (Dec., 2015): 18-30.

Otto, Rudolph. *The Idea of the Holy: An Inquiry into the Non-Rational Factor in the Idea of the Divine and its Relation to the Rational.* Translated by John W. Harvey. London: Oxford University Press, 1926.

Oviedo, Lluis, Scarlett de Courcier, and Miguel Farias. "Rise of Pilgrims on the *Camino* to Santiago: Sign of Change or Religious Revival?" *Review of Religious Research* 56, no. 3 (Sept., 2014): 433-442.

Perazzoli, Laura and Dave Whitson. *The Northern Caminos: The Norte, Primitivo and Inglés Routes.* London: Cicerone Press, 2015.